

February 15, 2019

REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD MINUTES

There was a meeting of the Real Estate Appraiser Board on February 15, 2019. The following were present: Sherman, Schubert, Martin, Lamprey, Griffin and Macagba. Also present was OPLC staff member Dawn Couture.

1. Call to order – 9:02 a.m.

2. Interview/meeting/hearing –

- a. Welcome new member Justin Macagba – The Board welcomed Justin Macagba and introduced themselves.
- b. 9:30 a.m. Show Cause Scott Bouthiette – Failure to take USPAP within a two year cycle – Hearing opened at 9:35 a.m. Mr. Bouthiette did not appear. Testimony was heard from staff member Dawn Couture. Hearing closed at 9:42 a.m.
- c. 10:30 a.m. Show Cause Jude Flynn Jr. – Failure to take USPAP within a two year cycle – Hearing opened at 10:37 a.m. Mr. Flynn did not appear. Testimony was heard from staff member Dawn Couture. Hearing closed at 10:42 a.m.

3. Reading and approval of the minutes of the December 14, 2018 meeting – Board member Lamprey made a motion which was appropriately seconded by Board member Sherman to approve the public minutes as written. Board member Schubert made a motion which was appropriately seconded by Board member Lamprey to amend the minutes with a minor change to item 4 (b) regarding which Board members were present and voted. The motion passed 4-0, Board members Griffin and Macagba abstained.

4. Communications –

- a. Email from Kiersten Gerow regarding continuing education – Ms. Gerow wrote a letter to the Board regarding continuing education; how difficult it has been to find an in classroom course and would like the Board to reconsider the continuing education requirements. Staff member Couture to respond.
- b. Letter from DOT's certified appraisers – The appraisers of NH's DOT wrote a letter expressing their concern of their employees to gain experience hours. Staff member Couture to reply back stating that the Board has no ability to modify any changes as these requirements are within The Personal Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria which is set by the Appraisal Qualifications Board (AQB). The Board does welcome them to attend a public meeting to discuss their concerns in person.

5. Unfinished Business – None.

6. New Business –

- a. Upon the motion of Lamprey and the second of Griffin, the Board voted by roll call vote, to conduct a non-public session for the purpose of discussing pending investigations and noting that such a non-public session is authorized by RSA 91-A:3, II (c) & (j), RSA 91-A:5, IV, Lodge v. Knowlton, 11 N.H. 574 (1978), and the Board's executive and deliberative privileges. Each member recorded his or her vote on the motion, which passed by the unanimous vote of all members present.

6. New Business, Continued –

- b. Upon the motion of Lamprey and Schubert, the Board by roll call vote resumed public session.
- c. Upon the motion of Griffin and the second of Sherman, the Board, by roll call vote, resolved to withhold the minutes of the preceding non-public session from public disclosure pursuant to RSA 91-A:3, III on the grounds that public disclosure would be likely to render the proposed action ineffective. Each member recorded his or her vote on the motion, which passed by the unanimous vote of all members present.
- d. SB 589-FN – Individuals may petition the licensing board for review of their criminal record concerning disqualification of licensure – The Board has reviewed and acknowledged.
- e. Draft Initial Proposal on AMC Rules – Attorney Broderick informed the Board that JLCAR had rejected the initial proposal of AMC rules voted on at the September 7, 2018 meeting due to the fact that the Board had voted to approve changes to Rab 306.01 and Rab 308.01 at the December 14, 2018 meeting. Board member Griffin made a motion which was appropriately seconded by Board member Schubert to accept the newly drafted proposal as written. The motion passed unanimously.
- f. Gregory Billings, Requesting waiver of renewal late fee – Board member Griffin made a motion which was appropriately seconded by Board member Sherman to deny his request. The motion passed 3-2.
- g. Deliberation on Show Cause Hearing, Scott Bouthiette – Board member Griffin made a motion which was appropriately seconded by Board member Martin to revoke Mr. Bouthiette’s Certified Residential license effective immediately for violation of RSA 310-B:16, Rab 403.02, Rab 403.02(b) and AQB criteria specific to continuing education section III, subsection F, Number 8. by: failing to remain in compliance with the Appraisal Qualifications Board’s (AQB) standards by failing to successfully complete a seven hour National Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP).
- h. Deliberation on Show Cause Hearing, Jude Flynn Jr. – Board member Griffin made a motion which was appropriately seconded by Board member Martin to revoke Mr. Flynn’s Certified General license effective immediately for violation of RSA 310-B:16, Rab 403.02, Rab 403.02(b) and AQB criteria specific to continuing education section III, subsection F, Number 8. by: failing to remain in compliance with the Appraisal Qualifications Board’s (AQB) standards by failing to successfully complete a seven hour National Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice (USPAP).
- i. Courses for Approval – Board member Martin made a motion which was appropriately seconded by Board member Lamprey to approve the following courses.

2019 Keynote Chicago
2019 Collateral Matters Chicago
Appraisers Essentials with CRS & Green Fields
Economic Outlook and Real Estate Trends 2019
Online Advanced Income Capitalization Synchronous
Online Advanced Market Analysis & Highest & Best Use

6. New Business, Continued –

- i. Courses for Approval – Board member Martin made a motion which was appropriately seconded by Board member Lamprey to approve the following courses.

Online Analyzing Operating Expenses
Online FHA Appraising: Principles & Procedures
Online Valuation Resources for Photovoltaic Sys.
Supervisory Appraiser / Trainee Appraiser Course
The Appraiser as the Expert Witness: Prep. & Tes.
2019 Appraisers Conference & Trade Show (ACTS) Day-1
2019 Appraisers Conference & Trade Show (ACTS) Day-2
Cost Approach for General Appraiser
Online Income Approach for General Appraiser, Part 1
Online Appraisal Review of Residential Properties
Online Green in Residences and Appraisal
Online Methodology & Application of Sales Comparison
Online Appraisal Review of Residential Properties
Online Covering all the Bases in Residential Reporting
Online FHA and VA Today
Online An Appraisers Guide to Expert Witness Assignments
Online Appraisal Review of Residential Properties
Online Green in Residences and Appraisal
Online Methodology & Application of Sales Comparison
Online National Appraising for the Supervisor & Trainee
Online Property & Valuation Analysis for FHA
Darker Shades of Gray
The Strange Case on Agile Mountain
Breakfast with the Experts: Market Analysis Techniques & Reporting
Financial Institutions Guide to Commercial Appraisal
Investment Income & Analysis for Income Properties
Statistics Modeling & Finance
Desktop Appraisals
Focus on FHA Minimum Property Requirements
Fundamentals of Income Property Appraisal
Online Residential Appraisal Review & USPAP Compliance
Online Residential Construction and the Appraiser
An Appraisers Guide to Expert Witness Assignments
Appraisal Review of Small Residential Income Properties

- j. Date and time of next meeting – ***Friday, March 15, 2019 @ 9:00 a.m.***

8. Adjournment – 12:10 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,



Dawn Couture
Supervisor II